

Appendix II: Comparison of Most Costly Management Limitations in SFI and Selected FSC Regional and National Standards for an Enterprise > 10,000 acres¹

	FSC Canada Boreal	FSC Russia ²	FSC Sweden	FSC Canada Great Lakes	FSC US Lake States	FSC US Northeast	FSC US Southeast	FSC United Kingdom	FSC British Columbia	FSC New Zealand ³	FSC US Pacific Coast	FSC US Rocky Mtn.	SFI US, Canada
Area certified (2008) (x 1,000 acres)	45,350	42,297	24,057	20,314	15,743	5,695	4,443	3,715	2,462	2,319	1,928	840	163,330
Harvest at sustainable rates?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Streams protected?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Width of streamside management zones (SMZs) specified?	66', additional 148' as needed Specific table for Yukon	References Russian law	References Swedish law	No	No	No	References state law and guidelines (BMPs)	References UK law and guidelines	230' (fish bearing) 132' (non-fish perennial) 50' (intermittent)	References NZ laws and BMPs, 15' setback for planting	150' (fish bearing) 100' (non-fish perennial) 75' (intermittent)	50', may be extended on steep slopes or erosive soils	References state and provincial laws and BMPs
"Clearcut size": limits on size of harvest openings?	No	No	No	No	No (natural forest) ⁴	No (natural forest)	No (natural forest) 40 acres ⁵ (plantation)	No	No	No	6 acres (natural forest) 40 acres average, 60 or 80 acres max. (plantations)	No (natural forest)	120 acres average
"Green-up": harvest limited until adjacent stand reaches a given height?	No	No	No	No (natural forest)	No (natural forest)	No (natural forest)	10' (hardwood plantations)	No	No	No	7' (plantation)	No (natural forest)	5' or 3 years
Retention requirements within harvest openings?	10% min. (5% if small harvest)	20 trees per acre (seed trees) or approx. 1% in clumps	4 trees/acre	10-12 trees per acre	No	No	No	No	5-10 trees per acre	No	30% (natural forest)	No	No ⁶
Mandatory set-aside of land? ⁷	No	Representative ecosystem network; 5% (regional standards)	5%	No	No	No	25% (plantation)	15% ⁸	No	10% encouraged but not mandatory	50% ⁹ (plantation)	No	No ¹⁰

¹ Sources: National Council for Air and Stream Improvement, SFI, FSC. Compiled by Coalition for Fair Forest Certification (2009).

² Regional standards in Russia may contain more detailed standards.

³ Based on Smartwood's interim standard for New Zealand.

⁴ The Lake States and some other US FSC standards include a 40-acre limit on clearcut size and a 10' green-up requirement in plantations, but certifications outside the US South and Pacific Northwest are unlikely to be classified by FSC as plantations.

⁵ Unless a larger opening can be justified by scientifically credible analysis.

⁶ SFI requires tree retention for wildlife but the number is unspecified. Some state rules and guidelines specify numbers, e.g., 2-5 trees per acre in WA and OR.

⁷ May include land reserved under other provisions. Other FSC US standards besides the US Southeast and Pacific Coast have set-asides under the plantation standard, but forests outside these two regions are unlikely to be classified as plantations. For comparison, FSC reported the average set-aside under its plantation standard globally as 12%.

⁸ At least 1% in plantations and 5% in semi-natural woodlands must be in reserves. This is similar to the 5% under the Swedish standard, which counts only productive forest toward the 5% and not land for which the landowner was compensated.

⁹ 20% must be set aside permanently and 30% for 30-40 years beyond financial targets.

¹⁰ The Coalition's experience under SFI in the US West and South is that an average of 14% of land is set aside for water quality, wildlife habitat and biodiversity rather than timber production.